The sixteenth century Protestant and Catholic Reformations had a significant impact on female religious orders and marked a critical juncture in the history of nuns. Both confessions moved to curtail female monastic power and autonomy (both spiritual and temporal), though Catholicism in many ways offered nuns a greater role in the Church than their Protestant sisters. This paper will explore the impact of the religious Reformations on European women who took religious vows, and discuss the ways in which they reacted to, and were shaped by, the reforms. Comparing and analysing the experiences of both Protestant and Catholic women, there appears a common thread running through the historical accounts of these Christ’s Brides: namely, the strength of their convictions and their determination to uphold their way of life in the face of extreme adversity, sometimes even at great personal cost. The historiography in this area is still in its formative stages, and this paper seeks to contribute to scholarship regarding the long-term legacy of the Reformation on the history of nuns.

The unique and watershed movement which shattered the unity of Latin Christendom into Catholic and Protestant traditions is known as the Reformation. It began in the sixteenth century as a revolt of the clergy against the teachings and abuses of the Catholic Church and Roman Papacy, spearheaded by the likes of leaders such as Martin Luther, Huldrych Zwingli and John Calvin. By the second half of the sixteenth century, the Roman Catholic Church, in response to the Protestant Reformation, experienced a revival movement known as the Counter-Reformation, initiated by the Council of Trent (the church council which met in 1545-63). During this period, religious

---


2  Ibid.
differences proved insurmountable, with vicious civil wars and widespread persecution devastating Europe for 150 years until an uneasy religious balance was restored. The establishment and
endurance of Lutheran and Reformed Churches of Europe as breakaway Christian confessions was
the result, as well as the beginning of religious toleration and peaceful coexistence in many parts
of Europe when it became evident that religious differences were permanent and irreconcilable. The Reformation had a profound effect on European society, and its widespread and enduring
effects altered the course of European history, including the history of female monasticism.

In early modern Europe, the church offered women the only acceptable alternative role in society
to being a wife and a mother: a nun. As a nun, a woman vowed to lead a celibate life, live according
to the community rules of her convent and worship daily. In return, she could receive training
in Latin, become an artist or a scholar, and retain her own identity and independence while
avoiding the physical traumas often experienced by fertile women who became wives and mothers.
Under Protestantism, female monasticism came under fire and was in some cases extinguished.
Throughout the 1520s, evangelical reformers argued that sexual misconduct by the clergy was
rampant and resulted in civic disorder which necessitated reform. Regarding priestly marriage and
forced celibacy, Luther wrote

They had neither the authority nor the right to forbid marriage and burden the divine
estate of priests with perpetual celibacy...therefore we are unwilling to consent to their
miserable celibacy, nor will we tolerate it. We want marriage to be free, as God ordered
and instituted it.

The Protestant rejection of celibacy in favour of marriage spelled the dissolution of convents
in Protestant territories, or where this did not eventuate, tremendous pressure was exerted on
the convents by the reformed communities. The assets of monastic orders were seized, many
nunneries were forced to convert and became Protestant establishments in order to stay open,
while others were forced to subsist on meagre incomes until their cloisters were eventually
dissolved. The impact of the Protestant Reformation on Christ’s Brides and the extent of their
survival varied greatly across Europe, and there were many geographical differences. Convent
numbers did significantly decrease as an immediate effect of Lutheranism, particularly in
territories such as Augsburg, however numbers rose once more towards the end of the century,
suggesting that the Protestant Reformation was not catastrophic to all nuns across Europe.

3 Benjamin Kaplan, ‘Coexistence, Conflict, and the Practice of Toleration,’ in A Companion to the Reformation World, ed. R. Po-
chia Hsia (Malden, Blackwell Publishing, 2006).
4 Ibid.
5 For a good introduction on the Reformation, see Cameron, European Reformation.
6 Martin Luther, ‘Concerning the Marriage of Priests,’ the Smalcald Articles (1537) in A Reformation Reader: Primary Texts with
7 Merry Wiesner, Women and Gender in Early Modern Europe, (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993), 192; Lyndal
8 Wiesner, Women and Gender, 192.
9 Merry Wiesner-Hanks, ‘Convents Confront the Reformation: Catholic and Protestant Nuns in Germany,’ in Reformation Texts
with Translation (1350-1650), trans. Joan Skocir and Merry Wiesner-Hanks, (Milwaukee: Marquette University Press, 1996), 12-
13.
10 For further reading on Lutheranism, see Paul Althaus, The Theology of Martin Luther, (Philadelphia: Fortress, 1966) and
Martin Brecht, Martin Luther, (Minneapolis: Fortress, 1985-93).
Although there were several complex reasons for this development (including nuns’ popular support from their communities and their traditionally high social standing), a large part must be attributed to the remarkable resilience and adaptability that nuns demonstrated in times of crisis.\textsuperscript{12}

The female religious response to the Protestant assault on monasticism was by no means homogenous. Many left the cloister, with some evidently won over to the new confession. It is evident that for some, it was the mixture of doctrinal persuasion and unfortunate personal experiences that compelled them to leave their convents. The records they left behind are telling of their commitment to the new faith’s theology. Their letters are replete with Protestant arguments about justification, rants against papist teachings, and grievances about the questionable practices witnessed in their cloisters. Ursula of Munsterberg is one such example. She escaped the cloister in 1528, and her letter to her family explaining the reasons for leaving the convent illustrate evidence of Lutheran influence.\textsuperscript{13} She described her convent experience as a ‘trap’ where she was held hostage ‘under the Babylonian Captivity’.\textsuperscript{14} Nonetheless her account must be balanced with the knowledge that her poor health and her family’s relative penury exacerbated her dissatisfaction with monastic life, and these were likely to have also influenced her decision.\textsuperscript{15}

Convents also contained many women forced into monastic life by their families to serve patrimonial interests or because they could not afford to finance marriage dowries for all of their daughters.\textsuperscript{16} This is particularly the case in early modern Italy, and Sharon Strocchia’s work on nuns and convents in Renaissance Florence explores the explosion of female monasticism in this Italian city as a result of deliberate family strategies.\textsuperscript{17} In the sixteenth century, the rise in the number of nuns and convents was caused in part by the inflation of marriage dowries, which resulted in many families forcing their daughters to become nuns.\textsuperscript{18} These women perhaps proved most receptive to the Protestant message, and this was an issue that would later be dealt with under the Catholic church’s reform agenda.\textsuperscript{19} Venetian writer and nun Arcangela Tarabotti is one example of forced monachization, and she wrote prolifically and passionately on this topic for most of her life.\textsuperscript{20} In \textit{Paternal Tyranny}, she strongly and bitterly denounced the practice of forcing girls

\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{13} Ronald Bainton, \textit{Women of the Reformation in Germany and Italy}, (Minneapolis, Minnesota: Augsburg Publishing House, 1971), 47-48.
\item \textsuperscript{14} Wiesner-Hanks, ‘Convents Confront the Reformation’, 63. According to Wiesner-Hanks, Luther used the expression ‘Babylonian Captivity’ to describe the Catholic Church in his 1520 treatise \textit{The Babylonian Captivity of the Christian Church} (Martin Luther, \textit{The Babylonian Captivity of the Christian Church}, \url{http://www.truthontheweb.org/luther.htm}, viewed 2 September 2014).
\item \textsuperscript{15} \textit{Ibid.}, 46.
\item \textsuperscript{17} Sharon Strocchia, \textit{Nuns and Nunneries in Renaissance Florence}, (Baltimore, Maryland: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 2009), 3.
\item \textsuperscript{18} \textit{Ibid.}, 31.
\item \textsuperscript{19} Gabriella Zarri, ‘From Prophecy to Discipline, 1450-1650,’ in \textit{Women and Faith: Catholic Religious Life in Italy from Late Antiquity to the Present}, ed. Lucetta Scaraffia and Gabriella Zarri, (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1999), 103.
\end{itemize}
into convent life, calling it a ‘heinous crime’ committed by fathers ostensibly under holy pretexts but really for their own self-interest.  

Once they left the convents, however, their experiences were less documented. One prominent woman’s experience that did remain was that of Genevan polemicist Marie Dentiere. Dentiere was a former abbess who left her Augustinian convent in the 1520s, and agitated for women’s right to preach and interpret Scripture, as demonstrated in her letter to Protestant sympathiser Queen Marguerite of Navarre in 1539.  

Note that many women are named and praised in the Holy Scripture, not only for their good morals, deeds, bearing and example, but for their faith and doctrine…seeing that work, surely I am unable to fall silent…if God has given graces to some good women, revealing to them something holy and good through his Holy Scripture, should they, for the sake of the defamer of the truth, refrain from writing down, speaking or declaring it to each other? Ah! It would be too impudent to hide the talent which God has given to us, we ought to have the grace to persevere to the end. Amen  

Alongside Calvin’s circle of male reformers, she even tried to convert other nuns such as the convent of Poor Clares but was unsuccessful. Ultimately she proved too radical even for the reformers, who were loath to accept women as their ecclesiastical equal.  

While some nuns clearly joined the Protestant cause, there were also others who stubbornly stayed loyal to the old Church. The work of historians such as Amy Leonard, Lyndal Roper, and Claire Walker provide a wealth of examples of Catholic nuns in Protestant territories who showed incredible courage and determination in the face of violent opposition. Particularly in German speaking territories, the nunneries’ fierce opposition to change also rendered them prime targets for reformed cities such as Augsburg and Nuremberg, where local councils were determined to enforce religious uniformity and Lutheranism. One prominent case was Nuremberg abbess of St Clares, Caritas Pirckheimer, who journaled her experiences in defending her cloister against the Council of Nuremberg from 1524 to 1528. Her significant intellect and strength of character is vividly illustrated in her journal, which contained letters she wrote to the Nuremberg council. In them, she demonstrated her ability to skilfully refute aspects of Lutheran theology. When lectured by a Protestant preacher, she wrote ‘…until there was unity in the Church we preferred to stay with the old faith and not be driven off by anyone…’ Another display of her ability to defend aspects of her faith can be seen in her argument championing celibacy: ‘We confess that maintaining chastity

23 Ibid.  
24 Ibid., 263, 266.  
26 Wiesner, Gender, Church and State, 51.  
is not given to everyone by God, it is also not denied to everyone...If marriage were such a good thing, then Christ could well have taken a wife, since man can decide to marry or not’.28

Against the Protestant assault on monastic celibacy, this was indeed a strong rebuttal, particularly in light of the fact that it pre-dates the Catholic Church’s Counter-Reformation, in which monasticism and clerical virginity was unequivocally reaffirmed as a state more desirable than marriage.

It is interesting to note that the factors contributing to the survival of some convents in Germany were ironically the same factors that rendered them vulnerable to the evangelical assault: their class and gender. The nuns’ elite and aristocratic backgrounds, coupled with entrenched traditions of privilege and power, was a source of resentment for Protestant governments. This resentment was exacerbated when female convents displayed civil disobedience by seeking support and protection from the Emperor or the Pope.29 The social status of nuns also proved problematic and expensive in the reformers’ attempts to disband them. Finding marriage partners of equal social standing and dowries or pensions to support nuns in the secular world was a complex, impractical, costly, and at times impossible exercise for the reformers.30 Finally, despite the reformers’ initial zeal in dissolving or closing the convents, in some areas their existence was tolerated as the nuns’ perceived fragility as a sex meant that they were considered relatively harmless compared to their male counterparts.31

Another illustration of the nuns’ reaction to Protestantism was the experience of the English nuns. Considerable numbers fled religious persecution in the wake of England’s dissolution of monasteries in 1539, and either joined existing convents or established their own in France, Portugal and the Low Countries.32 There they were integral in creating an expatriate English community with exiled Catholic laity and clergy; a community which, at times, colluded in political activism in the hope of England’s reunification with Rome and their eventual return home.33 Finally, there is also evidence that in some territories, Catholic and Protestant women lived together peacefully, suggesting that loyalty to their religion was secondary to their personal autonomy and commitment to their orders, or perhaps simply evidence of pragmatism.34 In Brunswick and Luneberg for example, many cloisters converted to Protestantism to survive, housing both Catholic and Protestant sisters, creating a curious amalgam of Protestant theology and Catholic practices, not dissimilar to Anglicanism.35

Protestantism was not the only challenge nuns had to contend with in the sixteenth century. The monastic reforms under the Council of Trent (1545-63) made life difficult for the female religious in the early modern period. In response to the outcry from evangelical reformers, the council issued decrees which clarified the ‘true’ Catholic teachings regarding ecclesiastical issues of

28 Ibid., 138.
29 Roper, The Holy Household, 214; Wiesner, Gender, Church and State, 51.
30 Roper, The Holy Household, 211; Woodford, Nuns as Historians, 6.
31 Wiesner, Gender, Church and State.
32 Walker, Gender and Politics, 2.
33 Ibid., 2.
34 Roper, The Holy Household, 214; Wiesner, Gender, Church and State, 53-54.
35 Wiesner, Gender, Church and State, 53.
contention and aimed to address many of the Protestants’ charges regarding the shortcomings and abuses of the church and its clergy. The cornerstone of the Tridentine decrees that greatly transformed the lives of nuns was *clausura*, or enclosure.36 Enclosure was in large part a response to the Protestant assault on monasticism and more specifically against its accusations that nuns were licentious, excessively engaged with the profane, and lacked genuine commitment to their vows.37 The consequences for the female monastic orders were immediate and serious; with adverse ramifications on their social and political status, their personal freedoms, and their economic circumstances.38 Similar to the Protestant preoccupation with preserving women’s sexual honour, the Tridentine enclosure agenda was driven by a need to safeguard nuns’ sexual purity.39 Enclosure demanded that Brides of Christ be physically separated from the outside world through not only the construction of concrete barriers, but also through the establishment of rules governing their movements and ensuring that they were inconspicuous and inaccessible to wider society.40 For many nuns, the construction of physical barriers in convents restricted social contact with their family and friends, spelling a loss of a source of pleasure and solace, particularly for those who did not choose this vocation willingly.31 Since the Middle Ages, in addition to their intercessory role in the community’s salvation, female monastic orders were integral participants in their communities, actively involved in civic life through a range of communal activities and municipal celebrations. Enclosure essentially marked the end of their participation in civic life.42 Socially and politically, therefore, for the nuns, their kin and their wider community, enclosure was a substantial blow. Finally, Tridentine reforms forced women to live a claustrophobic life, sharing all meals, prayers and reposes together, and also stripped them of any private properties or funds.43 Income-generating activities were also disallowed under Trent, subjecting many cloisters to financial hardship. English expatriate nuns who escaped to the continent in particular suffered greatly under this legislation, and in many cases they faced financial ruin.44

Under Tridentine reform, the nuns’ long cherished independence and ability to govern themselves and their cloisters was undermined, as male ecclesiastical authorities assumed administration of the nunneries.45 Bishops, who were often related to the nuns, spearheaded these reforms and began to administer nuns’ property, regularly inspecting convents, intermittently interrogating individual nuns – in short, doing everything in their power to safeguard the dignity of monasticism as a Christian institution. 46

Again, the nuns’ reactions to these reforms varied. While many opposed the changes for as long as they could, resorting in open or covert rebellion, others accepted the changes and worked

36 Walker, *Gender and Politics*, 47.
39 Walker, *Gender and Politics*, 47.
41 Zarri, *From Prophecy to Discipline*, 186.
42 Evangelisti, *We Do Not Have It*, 689.
45 Zarri, ‘From Prophecy to Discipline,’ 103; Evangelisti, ‘We Do Not Have It,’ 690.
46 Zarri, ‘From Prophecy to Discipline,’ 103.
within the system, devising ingenious ways to interpret the rules in ways that allowed them to survive. Italian nuns, in particular, vehemently opposed enclosure. In Florence, nuns relentlessly remonstrated against external intervention in the administration of their cloisters, and did everything in their power to be obstructive. In 1534, the nuns of San Pier Maggore even took legal action against the archbishop’s orders for the construction of parlor grates. Similarly in 1575 the nuns of St Catherine of Siena resolutely refused enclosure – having gained a papal exemption from enclosure, they rejected Tridentine reform and insisted on their legitimate right to remain opened. Certainly some nuns left their convents in protest and were excommunicated. It is also clear that some women who founded new religious orders simply refused to be enclosed, and Mary Ward’s Institute of the Blessed Virgin Mary established in the early seventeenth century was a case in point.

Nonetheless, some orders positively embraced the changes, quickly realising some of the benefits that could be exploited to their advantage. Teresa of Avila’s Carmelite nuns, for example, enforced strict compliance with enclosure on its members. Teresa viewed enclosure as empowering, allowing nuns to focus solely on their vocation by providing a bulwark against the diversions of secular society. Enclosure was also utilised by some nuns as a weapon against outside impediments and control by secular rulers. Prioress Barbara Bernheimer of Kirchheim used enclosure regulations to evade ducal attempts to interfere with her authority. Furthermore, other nuns found ways to either circumvent the decrees or at least mitigate their impact. The English expatriate nunneries accepted enclosure but in order to survive they raised money by opening schools for Catholic girls, accommodating boarders, or by utilizing their musical talents to gain donations. They even sold their handicraft and embroidery works as ‘souvenirs’ to English tourists. The English nuns also bartered with their local community, providing prayers and saying masses for local merchants, tradesmen and the wider community in return for services rendered and all forms of charitable donations and sponsorship. From these examples, it is clear that far from being passive victims in these religious reformations, nuns were proactive agents demonstrating remarkable resilience, adaptability and ingenuity in the face of tremendous threats to their faith, autonomy and way of life.

The outcomes of the nuns’ reactions to the Protestant and Catholic Reformations were varied and complex. In many ways the nuns’ attempts at resistance proved ultimately futile. In many Protestant territories, convents did close or were allowed to die out. This was the case with Caritas Pirckheimer’s dogged fight to preserve her cloister in hostile Protestant territory. On the other hand, she did succeed in maintaining her convent despite making compromises, and her nuns lived

48 Strocchia, Nuns and Nunneries, 190.
49 Evangelisti, ‘We Do Not Have It,’ 694.
50 Leonard, Nails in the Wall, 28.
51 Fairchilds, Women in Early Modern Europe, 223.
52 Walker, Gender and Politics, 49.
54 Walker, Gender and Politics, 75-99.
55 Ibid., 90.
the remainder of their lives there. Similarly, enclosure under Post-Tridentine Church eventually prevailed, as nuns were forced to acquiesce or face excommunication. Despite these defeats, the female religious continued to cope and navigate challenges created by the reformation as best as they could.

As the sixteenth century drew to a close, the Catholic authorities could not completely suppress women’s attempts to serve their Church in more active, apostolic ways. The Protestant challenge sparked a new wave of religiosity among Catholics, evident in the emergence of a growing number of new religious orders towards the latter half of the sixteenth century. Examples of these include the Ursulines, Mary Ward’s Institute of the Blessed Virgin Mary and arguably also the rise of unencloistered, more secular organisations such as the French Daughters of Charity. Although the Ursulines and Mary Ward’s organisation ran foul of the ecclesiastical hierarchy, they still managed to survive in more secular forms. The apostolic work pioneered by the nuns still exists in the modern era: in charitable works for the poor and disadvantaged, and in the caring professions of teaching and nursing. It is evident that nuns’ determination to lead apostolic lives as a result of the Reformation led to greater engagement with the secular world, and this can be seen in the missionary work overseas, in the New World from the sixteenth century onwards and in Asia and Africa in current times.

In the last two decades, research into the field of female monasticism (particularly Catholic monasticism) has blossomed. Despite this, since the early modern period, there remain scant records explaining the reasons why women left their convents, their experiences after their departure, and how they endured the breakdown of their sisterhoods. Furthermore, there is also a paucity of research on female monasticism in Eastern Europe, in particular how enclosure affected Orthodox or Greek Catholic nuns. The historiography does suggest that overall, the Catholic Church seemed to offer women greater opportunities for influence and provided more avenues to actively express their faith compared to their Protestant opposites. Despite initial resistance, the post-Tridentine Church eventually sanctioned women’s participation in education and missionary work. However, it is also evident that regardless of the path they ultimately chose, the female religious demonstrated that they were far from passive, fragile victims of ecclesiastical reform. The historiography in this field is still relatively new, and although historians such as Gabrielle Zarri and Silvia Evangelisti have made significant progress in this area, more scholarship is needed to bridge the gap in our knowledge and understanding of the nuns’ experience since the early modern period.

57 Evangelisti, ‘We Do Not Have It,’ 698-699; Strocchia, Nuns and Nunneries, 190; Lowe, Nuns’ Chronicles and Convent Culture, 195; Fairchilds, *Women in Early Modern Europe*, 218.